

Interactive comment on “A comparison between remotely-sensed and modelled surface soil moisture (and frozen status) at high latitudes” by I. Gouttevin et al.

S. J. Schymanski (Editor)

stan.schymanski@env.ethz.ch

Received and published: 27 November 2013

The manuscript has been reviewed by four experts in the field, all of which made very constructive suggestions for improvements. I wholeheartedly concur with Referee 4 in pointing out the importance of evaluating land surface models using appropriate data but I also acknowledge the problems all of the reviewers pointed out, among others:

- inconclusive results
- lack of significant new insights

Full Screen / Esc

Printer-friendly Version

Interactive Discussion

Discussion Paper



- incomplete analyses
- not up-to-date model and parameterisations used in evaluation
- lack of systematic assessment of uncertainties in model and Earth Observation data

I therefore hope that the constructive recommendations will motivate and help the authors to complement the current results with more meaningful analysis and resubmit an insightful and publishable manuscript at a later stage. Since the reviewers were not able to gain any significant insights from the current manuscript, and given their suggestions for substantial additional analyses and re-organisation of the manuscript, I feel that resubmission of a new, improved manuscript would be more beneficial than explicitly addressing each reviewer comment in a response letter. The manuscript would have to undergo another review process before publication in any case. At this point I would like to thank the reviewers for their constructive and thorough reviews and I hope that this will help making meaningful progress towards generation of consistent Earth Observation data and land surface models.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 11241, 2013.

HESSD

10, C6466–C6467, 2013

[Interactive
Comment](#)

[Full Screen / Esc](#)

[Printer-friendly Version](#)

[Interactive Discussion](#)

[Discussion Paper](#)