

Interactive comment on “Do changes in climate or vegetation regulate evapotranspiration and streamflow trends in water-limited basins?” by Q. Liu et al.

B. van den Hurk (Editor)

hurkvd@knmi.nl

Received and published: 19 December 2014

The paper is improved a bit but does not answer all the questions raised by the reviewers:

- The title on the revised manuscript does not reflect the title in the reply
- A major comment was the poor justification of the assumed positive relationship between Z_e and annual precip. I prefer not to give a long set of equations, but to provide a figure of how Z_e varies with P in your model, and comment on the shape

C5762

of this figure using biophysical arguments such as those proposed by Schenk and Jackson (2002).

- In section 4 you discuss the relative influence of P , Z_e , α and E_p on the actual evaporation. However, Z_e is not an independent quantity as it depends on P . So the relative influence of these factors is not clear. Also it is not obvious how I can deduce the order of importance ($P > Z_e > \alpha > E_p$) from the figures you show. This needs more clarification
- The caption of Figure 2 misses a description of the period over which the trend is shown
- The chosen color scale in figure 4 does not print very well
- Figure 5 misses a significance indication, such as provided in Fig 6
- I suggest to combine the upper and lower panels in Figure 6 by showing the significant grid points by a small dot or shading on top of the value. And a plot of the difference between the scenarios would be interesting as well
- Fig 7a and 7b seem to be exactly complementary (and adding up to 1). You can consider to use only one figure
- The english still needs improvement

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 11, 11183, 2014.

C5763