Interactive comment on “Probability distributions for explaining hydrological losses in South Australian catchments” by S. H. P. W. Gamage et al.

N.E.C. Verhoest (Editor)
niko.verhoest@ugent.be

Received and published: 30 June 2013

The paper was reviewed by three reviewers and 2 out of three had severe remarks with respect to the novelty of the work or the methods applied. The third reviewer found this paper interesting as the information provided seems to be lacking in Australia. However, I believe that papers in HESS should try to make progress in research, and if questions are posed with respect to whether the state-of-the-art is being applied, then some major concerns should be made with respect to the submitted paper. This paper should undergo a major revision in which significant improvements should be made to the analyses techniques (including performing multivariate analyses instead of univariate ones and testing the technique in independent catchments). If such improvements are not made, the paper cannot be published in HESS.

I advice the authors to carefully address each of the comments made by the reviewers, and rework the manuscript accordingly. Once resubmitted, the paper will be sent out for re-review.

Kind regards,

N. Verhoest

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 10, 4597, 2013.