Variability in snow cover phenology in China from 1952 to 2010

Chang-Qing Ke\textsuperscript{1,2,6}, Xiu-Cang Li\textsuperscript{3,4}, Hongjie Xie\textsuperscript{5}, Dong-Hui Ma\textsuperscript{1,6}, Xun Liu\textsuperscript{1,2} and Cheng Kou\textsuperscript{1,2}

\textsuperscript{1}. Jiangsu Provincial Key Laboratory of Geographic Information Science and Technology, Nanjing University, Nanjing, 210023, China.

\textsuperscript{2}. Key Laboratory for Satellite Mapping Technology and Applications of State Administration of Surveying, Mapping and Geoinformation of China, Nanjing University, Nanjing, 210023, China.

\textsuperscript{3}. National Climate Center, China Meteorological Administration, Beijing 100081, China.

\textsuperscript{4}. Collaborative Innovation Center on Forecast and Evaluation of Meteorological Disasters, Faculty of Geography and Remote Sensing, Nanjing University of Information Science & Technology, Nanjing, 210044, China.

\textsuperscript{5}. Department of Geological Sciences, University of Texas at San Antonio, Texas 78249, USA.

\textsuperscript{6}. Collaborative Innovation Center of South China Sea Studies, Nanjing, 210023, China

Correspondence to: C. Q. Ke (kecq@nju.edu.cn)

Tel: 0086-25-89685860

Fax: 0086-25-83592686
Abstract  Daily snow observation data from 672 stations, particularly the 296 stations with over ten annual mean snow cover days (SCD), during 1952–2010 in China, are used in this study. We first examine spatiotemporal variations and trends of SCD (per year), snow cover onset date (SCOD), and snow cover end date (SCED). We then investigate SCD (per year) relationships with number of days with temperature below 0°C (TBZD), mean air temperature (MAT), and Arctic Oscillation (AO) index. The results indicate that years with positive SCD (per year) anomaly for the entire country include 1955, 1957, 1964, and 2010, and years with negative SCD (per year) anomaly include 1953, 1965, 1999, 2002, and 2009. The reduced TBZD and increased MAT are the main reasons for the overall late SCOD and early SCED since 1952. This explains why only 12% of the stations show significant shortening of SCD (per year), while 75% of the stations show no significant change in the SCD (per year) trends. Our analyses indicate that the SCD (per year) distribution pattern and trends in China are very complex and are not controlled by any single climate variable examined (i.e. TBZD, MAT, or AO), but a combination of multiple variables. It is found that the AO has the maximum impact on the SCD (per year) shortening trends in the Shandong Peninsula, Changbai Mountains, Xiaoxingganling and North Xinjiang, while the combined TBZD and MAT have the maximum impact on the SCD (per year) shortening trends in the Loess Plateau, Tibetan Plateau, and Northeast Plain.

Keywords: snow cover day; snow cover onset date; snow cover end date; temporal trend; days with temperature below 0°C; Arctic Oscillation; China
Abbreviations:

Snow Cover Day (SCD)
Snow Cover Onset Date (SCOD)
Snow Cover End Date (SCED)
Days with Temperature Below 0°C (TBZD)
Mean Air Temperature (MAT)
Arctic Oscillation (AO)

1 Introduction

Snow has a profound impact on the surficial and atmospheric thermal conditions, and is very sensitive to climatic and environmental changes, because of its high reflectivity, low thermal conductivity, and hydrological effects via snowmelt (Barnett et al., 1989; Groisman et al., 1994). The extent of snow cover in the Northern Hemisphere decreased significantly over the past decades because of global warming (Robinson and Dewey 1990; Brown and Robinson 2011). Snow cover showed the largest decrease in the spring, and the decrease rate increased for higher latitudes in response to larger albedo feedback (Déry and Brown, 2007). In North America, snow depth in central Canada showed the greatest decrease (Dyer and Mote, 2006), and snowpack in the Rocky Mountains in the U.S. declined (Pederson et al., 2013). However, in situ data showed a significant increase in snow accumulation in winter but a shorter snowmelt
season over Eurasia (Bulygina et al., 2009). Decrease in snow pack has also been found in the European Alps in the last 20 years of the 20th century (Scherrer et al., 2004), but a very long time series of snow pack suggests large decadal variability and overall weak long-term trends only (Scherrer et al., 2013). Meteorological data indicated that the snow cover over northwest China exhibited a weak upward trend in snow depth (Qin et al., 2006), with large spatiotemporal variations (Ke et al., 2009; Ma and Qin 2012). Simulation experiments using climate models indicated that, with continuing global warming, the snow cover in China would show more variations in space and time than ever before (Shi et al., 2011; Ji and Kang 2013). Spatiotemporal variations of snow cover are also manifested as snowstorms or blizzards, particularly excessive snowfall over a short time duration (Bolsenga and Norton, 1992; Liang et al., 2008; Gao, 2009; Wang et al., 2013; Llasat et al., 2014).

Snow cover day (SCD) (per year) is an important index that represents the environmental features of climate (Ye and Ellison 2003; Scherrer et al., 2004), and is directly related to the radiation and heat balance of the Earth–atmosphere system. The SCD (per year) varies in space and time and contributes to climate change over short time scales (Zhang, 2005), especially in the Northern Hemisphere. Bulygina et al. (2009) investigated the linear trends of SCD (per year) observed at 820 stations from 1966 to 2007, and indicated that the duration of snow cover decreased in the northern regions of European Russia and in the mountainous regions of southern Siberia, while it increased in Yakutia and the Far East. Peng et al. (2013) analysed trends in the snow cover onset date (SCOD) and snow cover end date (SCED) in relation to temperature
over the past 27 years (1980–2006) from over 636 meteorological stations in the
Northern Hemisphere. They found that the SCED remained stable over North America,
whereas there was an early SCED over Eurasia. Satellite-derived snow data indicated
that the average snow season duration over the Northern Hemisphere decreased at a rate
of 5.3 days per decade between 1972/73 and 2007/08 (Choi et al., 2010). Their results
also showed that a major change in the trend of snow duration occurred in the late
1980s, especially in Western Europe, central and East Asia, and mountainous regions in
western United States.

There are large spatiotemporal differences in the SCD (per year) in China (Wang
and Li, 2012). Analysis of 40 meteorological stations from 1971 to 2010 indicated that
the SCD (per year) had a significant decreasing trend in the western and south-eastern
Tibetan Plateau, with the largest decline observed in Nielamu, reaching 9.2 days per
decade (Tang et al., 2012). Data analysis also indicated that the SCD (per year) had a
linear decreasing trend at most stations in the Hetao region and its vicinity (Xi et al.,
2009). However, analysis of meteorological station data in Xinjiang showed that the
SCD (per year) had a slight increasing trend, occurring mainly in 1960–1980 (Wang et
al., 2009b). Li et al. (2009) analysed meteorological data from 80 stations in
Heilongjiang Province, Northeast China. Their results showed that the snow cover
duration shortened, because of both the late SCOD (by 1.9 days per decade) and early
SCED (by 1.6 days per decade), which took place mainly in the lower altitude plains.

The SCD (per year) is sensitive to local winter temperature and precipitation,
al., 2013), and altitudinal gradient and terrain roughness (Lehning et al., 2011; Ke and Liu, 2014). Essentially, the SCD (per year) variation is mainly attributed to large-scale atmospheric circulation or climatic forcing (Beniston, 1997; Scherrer and Appenzeller, 2006; Ma and Qin, 2012; Birsan and Dumitrescu, 2014), such as monsoons, El Niño/Southern Oscillation (ENSO), North Atlantic Oscillation (NAO), and Arctic Oscillation (AO). Xu et al. (2010) investigated the relationship between the SCD (per year) and monsoon index in the Tibetan Plateau and their results indicated that there were great spatial differences. As an index of the dominant pattern of non-seasonal sea-level pressure variations, the AO shows a large impact on the winter weather patterns of the Northern Hemisphere (Thompson and Wallace, 1998; Thompson et al., 2000; Gong et al., 2001; Wu and Wang, 2002; Jeong and Ho, 2005). The inter-annual variation of winter extreme cold days in the northern part of eastern China is closely linked to the AO (Chen et al., 2013). Certainly, the AO plays an important role in the SCD (per year) variation. An increase in the SCD (per year) before 1990 and a decrease after 1990 have been reported in the Tibetan Plateau, and snow duration has positive correlations with the winter AO index (You et al., 2011), and a significant correlation between the AO and snowfall over the Tibetan Plateau on inter-decadal timescale was also reported by Lü et al. (2008).

The focus of this study is the variability in the snow cover phenology in China. A longer time series of daily observations of snow cover is used for these spatial and temporal analyses. We first characterize the spatial patterns of change in the SCD (per year), SCOD, and SCED in different regions of China; we then examine the sensitivity
of SCD (per year) to the number of days with temperature below 0°C (TBZD), the mean air temperature (MAT), and the Arctic Oscillation (AO) index during the snow season (between SCOD and SCED).

2 Data and methods

2.1 Data

We use daily snow cover and temperature data in China from the 1 September 1951 to the 31 August 2010, provided by the National Meteorological Information Centre of China Meteorological Administration (CMA). According to the Specifications for Surface Meteorological Observations (China Meteorological Administration, 2003), an SCD is defined as a day when the snow cover in the area meets the following requirement: at least half of the observation field is covered by snow. For any day with at least half of the observation field covered by snow, snow depth is recorded as a rounded-up integer. For example, a normal SCD is recorded if the snow depth is equal to or more than 1.0 cm (measured with a ruler), or a thin SCD if the snow depth is less than 1.0 cm. A snow year is defined at the time period from September 1 of the previous year to August 31 of the current year. For instance, September, October, and November 2009 are treated as the autumn season of snow year 2010, December 2009 and January and February 2010 as the winter season of snow year 2010, and March, April, and May 2010 as the spring season of snow year 2010.

Station density is high in eastern China, where the observational data for most stations are complete, with relatively long histories (as long as 59 years), while station density is low in western China, and the observation history is relatively short, although
two of the three major snow regions are located in western China. If all stations with short time series are eliminated, the spatial representativeness of the dataset would be a problem. Therefore, a time series of at least 30 years is included in this study.

Because of topography and climate conditions, the discontinuous nature of snowfall is obvious in western China, especially in the Tibetan Plateau, with patchy snow cover, and there are many thin SCD records (Ke and Li, 1998). However, in order to enhance data reliability, according to the previous studies (An et al., 2009; Wang and Li, 2012), thin SCDs in the original dataset are not taken into account in this paper.

Totally, there are 722 stations in the original dataset. Since station relocation and changes in the ambient environment could cause inconsistencies in the recorded data, we implement strict quality controls (such as inspection for logic, consistency, and uniformity) on the observational datasets in order to reduce errors (Ren et al., 2005).

The standard normal homogeneity test (Alexandersson and Moberg, 1997) at the 95% confidence level is applied to the daily SCD and temperature series data in order to identify possible breakpoints. Time series gap filling is performed after all inhomogeneities are eliminated, using nearest neighbour interpolation. After being processed as mentioned above, the 672 stations with annual mean SCDs greater than 1.0 (day) are finally selected for subsequent investigation (Fig. 1).

The observation period for each station is different, varying between 59 years (1951/1952–2009/2010) and 30 years (1980/1981–2009/2010). Overall, 588 stations have observation records between 50 and 59 years, 47 stations between 40 and 49 years, and 37 stations between 30 and 39 years (Fig. 2). Most of the stations with observation
records of less than 50 years are located in remote or high elevation areas. All 672 stations are used to analyse the spatiotemporal distribution of SCD (per year) in China, while only 296 stations with more than ten annual mean SCDs are used to study the changes of SCOD, SCED, and SCD (per year) relationships with TBZD, MAT, and the AO index.

The daily AO index constructed by projecting the daily (00Z) 1,000 mb height anomalies poleward of 20°N from http://www.cpc.ncep.noaa.gov/products/precip/CWlink/daily_ao_index/ao.shtml is used. A positive (negative) AO index corresponds to low (high) pressure anomalies throughout the polar region and high (low) pressure anomalies across the subtropical and mid-latitudes (Peings et al., 2013). We average the daily AO indexes during the snow season of each station as the AO index of the snow year. A time series of AO indexes from 1952 to 2010, for each of the 296 stations, is then constructed.

A digital elevation model (DEM) from the Shuttle Radar Topographic Mission (SRTM, http://srtm.cgiar.org) of the National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) with a resolution of 90 m and the administration map of China are used as the base map.

2.2 Methods

We apply Mann–Kendall (MK) test to analyse the trends of SCD (per year), SCOD, and SCED. The MK test is an effective tool to extract the trends of time series, and is widely applied to the analysis of climate series (Marty, 2008). The MK test is characterized as being more objective, since it is a non-parametric test. A positive
standardized MK statistic value indicates an upward or increasing trend, while a negative value demonstrates a downward or decreasing trend. Confidence levels of 90% and 95% are taken as thresholds to classify the significance of positive and negative trends of SCD (per year), SCOD, and SCED.

At the same time, if SCD (per year), SCOD, or SCED at one climate station has significant MK trend (above 90%), their linear regression analyses are performed against time, respectively. The slopes of the regressions represent the changing trends and are expressed in days per decade. The statistical significance of the slope for each of the linear regressions is assessed by the Student’s $t$ test (two-tailed test of the Student $t$ distribution), and confidence levels of 90% and 95% are considered.

Correlation analysis is used to examine the SCD (per year) relationships with the TBZD, MAT, and the AO index, and the Pearson product-moment correlation coefficients (PPMCC) have been calculated. The PPMCC is a widely used estimator for describing the spatial dependence of rainfall processes, and it indicates the strength of the linear covariance between two variables (Habib et al., 2001; Ciach and Krajewski, 2006). The statistical significance of the correlation coefficients is calculated using the Student’s $t$ test, and confidence levels above 90% are considered significant in our analysis.

The spatial distribution of SCD (per year), SCOD, and SCED, and their calculated results, are spatially interpolated by applying the ordinary kriging method.

3 Results

3.1 Cross-validation of the spatial interpolations
All mean errors are near zero, all average standard errors are close to the corresponding root mean squared errors, and all root mean squared standardized errors are close to 1 (Table 1). This fact indicates that prediction errors are unbiased and valid, except for slightly overestimated coefficients of variation (CV) and slightly underestimated SCD in 2002. Overall, the interpolation results have fewer errors and are acceptable.

3.2 Spatiotemporal variations of SCD (per year)

3.2.1 Spatial distribution of SCD (per year)

The analysis of observations from 672 stations indicates that there are three major stable snow regions with more than 60 annual mean SCDs (Li, 1990): Northeast China, North Xinjiang, and the Tibetan Plateau, with Northeast China being the largest of the three (Fig. 3a). In the Daxingganling, Xiaoxingganling, and Changbai Mountains of Northeast China, there are more than 90 annual mean SCDs, corresponding to a relatively long snow season. The longest annual mean SCDs, 163 days, is at Arxan Station (in the Daxinganling Mountains) in Inner Mongolia. In North Xinjiang, the SCDs (per year) are relatively long in the Tianshan and Altun Mountains, followed by the Junggar Basin. The annual mean SCDs in the Himalayas, Nyainqentanglha, Tanggula Mountains, Bayan Har Mountains, Anemaqen Mountains, and Qilian Mountains of the Tibetan Plateau are relatively long, although most of these regions have less than 60 annual SCDs. The Tibetan Plateau has a high elevation, a cold climate, and many glaciers, but its mean SCD is not as large as that of the other two stable snow regions.
Area with SCDs of 10–60 per year is called unstable snow regions with annual periodicity (definitely with snow cover in every winter) (Li, 1990). It includes the peripheral parts of the three major stable snow regions, Loess Plateau, Northeast Plain, North China Plain, Shandong Peninsula, and regions north of the Qinling-Huaihe line (along the Qinling Mountains and Huaihe River to the east). Area with SCDs of 1–10 per year is called unstable snow region without annual periodicity (the mountainous regions are excluded) (Li, 1990). It includes the Qaidam Basin, Badain Jaran Desert, the peripheral parts of Sichuan Basin, the northeast part of the Yungui Plateau, and the middle and lower Yangtze River Plain. Areas with occasional snow and mean annual SCD of less than 1.0 (day) are distributed north of the Sichuan Basin and in the belt along Kunming, Nanling Mountains, and Fuzhou (approximate latitude of 25°N). Because of the latitude or local climate and terrain, there is no snow in the Taklimakan Desert, Turpan Basin, the Yangtze River Valley in the Sichuan Basin, the southern parts of Yunnan, Guangxi, Guangdong and Fujian, and on the Hainan Island.

The spatial distribution pattern of SCD (per year) based on climate data with longer time series is similar to previous studies (Li and Mi, 1983; Li, 1990; Liu et al., 2012; Wang et al., 2009a; Wang and Li, 2012). Snow distribution is closely linked to latitude and elevation, and is generally consistent with the climate zones (Lehning et al., 2011; Ke and Liu, 2014). There are relatively more SCDs (per year) in Northeast China and North Xinjiang, and fewer SCDs (per year) to the south (Fig. 3a). In the Tibetan Plateau, located in south-western China, the elevation is higher than eastern areas at the same latitude, and the SCDs (per year) are greater than in eastern China (Tang et al., 2015).
The amount of precipitation also plays a critical role in determining the SCD (per year) (Hantel et al., 2000). In the north-eastern coastal areas of China, which are affected considerably by ocean, there is much precipitation. In North Xinjiang, which has a typical continental (inland) climate, the precipitation is less than in Northeast China, and there are more SCDs (per year) in the north of Northeast China than in North Xinjiang (Dong et al., 2004; Wang et al., 2009b). Moreover, the local topography has a relatively large impact on the SCD (per year) (Lehning et al., 2011). The Tarim Basin is located inland, with relatively little precipitation, thus snowfall there is extremely rare except in the surrounding mountains (Li, 1993). The Sichuan Basin is surrounded by high mountains, therefore situated in the precipitation shadow in winter, resulting in fewer SCDs (per year) (Li and Mi, 1983; Li, 1990).

The three major stable snow regions, Northeast China, North Xinjiang, and the eastern Tibetan Plateau, have smaller CV in the SCD (per year) (Fig. 3b). Nevertheless, the SCDs (per year) in arid or semi-arid regions, such as South Xinjiang, the northern and south-western Tibetan Plateau, and central and western Inner Mongolia, show large fluctuations because there is little precipitation during the cold seasons, and certainly little snowfall and large CVs of SCD (per year). In particular, the Taklimakan Desert in the Tarim Basin is an extremely arid region, with only occasional snowfall. Therefore, it has a very large range of SCD (per year) fluctuations. Additionally, the middle and lower Yangtze River Plain also has large SCD (per year) fluctuations because of warm-temperate or sub-tropic climate with short winter and little snowfall. Generally, the smaller the SCD (per year), the larger the CV (Wang et al., 2009a). This is
consistent with other climate variables, such as precipitation (Yang et al., 2015).

### 3.2.2 Temporal variations of SCD

Seasonal variation of SCD is primarily controlled by temperature and precipitation (Hantel et al., 2000; Scherrer et al., 2004; Liu et al., 2012). In North Xinjiang and Northeast China, snow is primarily concentrated in the winter (Fig. 4). In these regions, the SCD (per year) exhibits a 'single-peak' distribution. In the Tibetan Plateau, however, the seasonal variation of SCD is slightly different, i.e. more snow in the spring and autumn combined than in the winter. The mean temperature and precipitation at Dangxiong station (30°29′ N, 91°06′E, 4200.0 m) in winter are -7.7 degrees Celsius and 7.9 mm, respectively, and those at Qingshuihe station (33°48′ N, 97°08′E, 4415.4 m) are -15.8 degrees Celsius and 16.3 mm, respectively. It is too cold and dry to produce enough snow in the Tibetan Plateau (Hu and Liang, 2014).

The temporal variation of SCD (per year) shows very large differences from one year to another. We define a year with a positive (negative) SCD (per year) anomaly in the following way: for a given year, if 70% of the stations have a positive (negative) anomaly and 30% of the stations have an SCD (per year) larger (smaller) than the mean +/- one standard deviation (1SD), it is regarded as a year with a positive (negative) SCD (per year) anomaly. The years with a positive SCD (per year) anomaly in China are 1955, 1957, 1964, and 2010 (Table 2). Moreover, the stations with SCDs (per year) larger than the mean + 2SD account for 25% and 26% of all stations in 1955 and 1957, respectively, and these two years are considered as years with an extremely positive SCD (per year) anomaly. In 1957, there was an almost nationwide positive SCD (per
year) anomaly except for North Xinjiang (Fig. 5a). This 1957 event had a great impact on agriculture, natural ecology, and social-economic systems, and resulted in a tremendous disaster (Hao et al., 2002).

Years with a negative SCD (per year) anomaly include 1953, 1965, 1999, 2002, and 2009 (Table 2). If there is too little snowfall in a specific year, a drought is possible. Drought resulting from little snowfall in the cold season is a slow process and can sometimes cause disasters. For example, East China displayed an apparent negative SCD (per year) anomaly in 2002 (Fig. 5b), and had very little snowfall, leading to an extreme winter drought in Northeast China, where snowfall is the primary form of winter precipitation (Fang et al., 2014).

Because of different atmospheric circulation backgrounds, vapour sources, and topographic conditions in different regions of China, there are great differences in the SCD even in one year. For example, in 2008, there were more SCDs and longer snow duration in the Yangtze River Basin, North China, and the Tianshan Mountains in Xinjiang (Fig. 5c), especially in the Yangtze River Basin, where large snowfall was normally not observed. However, four episodes of severe and persistent snow, extreme low temperatures, and freezing weather occurred in 2008, led to a large-scale catastrophe in this region (Gao, 2009). As reported by the Ministry of Civil Affairs of China, the 2008 snow disaster killed 107 people and caused losses of US$ 15.45 billion. Both the SCDs (per year) and scale of economic damage broke records from the past five decades (Wang et al., 2008). On the contrary, there was no snow disasters in North Xinjiang, the Tibetan Plateau, and Pan-Bohai Bay region in 2008. Moreover, Northeast
China had an apparent negative SCD (per year) anomaly (Fig. 5c).

There are great differences in the temporal variations of SCD (per year) even in the three major stable snow regions. If we redefine a year with a positive (negative) SCD (per year) anomaly using a much higher standard (i.e. 80% of stations have a positive (negative) anomaly and 40% of stations have an SCD (per year) larger (smaller) than the mean +/- 1SD), it is found that 1957, 1973, and 2010 are years with a positive SCD (per year) anomaly in Northeast China, while 1959, 1963, 1967, 1998, 2002, and 2008 are years with a negative SCD (per year) anomaly (Table 3, Fig. 5a–c). Years with a positive SCD (per year) anomaly in North Xinjiang include 1960, 1977, 1980, 1988, 1994, and 2010, and years with a negative SCD (per year) anomaly include 1974, 1995, and 2008 (Table 3, Fig. 5c). North Xinjiang is one of the regions prone to snow disaster, where frequent heavy snowfall greatly affects the development of animal husbandry (Hao et al., 2002).

Years with a positive SCD (per year) anomaly in the Tibetan Plateau include 1983 and 1990, whereas years with a negative SCD (per year) anomaly include 1965, 1969, and 2010 (Table 3). The climate in the Tibetan Plateau is affected by the Indian monsoon from the south, westerlies from the west, and the East Asian monsoon from the east (Yao et al., 2012). Therefore, there is a spatial difference in the SCD (per year) within the Tibetan Plateau, and a difference in the spatiotemporal distribution of snow disasters (Wang et al., 2013). Our results differ from the conclusions drawn by Dong et al. (2001), as they only used data from 26 stations, covering only a short period (1967–1996).
### 3.2.3 SCD trends

Changing trends of annual SCDs are examined, as shown in Figure 6a, and summarized in Table 4. Among the 296 stations, there are 35 stations (12%) with a significant negative trend, and 37 stations (13%) with a significant positive trend (both at the 90% level), while 75% of stations show no significant trends. The SCD (per year) exhibits a significant downward trend in the Xiaoxingganling, the Changbai Mountains, the Shandong Peninsula, the Qilian Mountains, the North Tianshan Mountains, and the peripheral zones in the south and eastern Tibetan Plateau (Fig. 6a). For example, the SCD (per year) decreased by 50 days from 1955 to 2010 at the Kuandian station in Northeast China, 28 days from 1954 to 2010 at the Hongliuhe station in Xinjiang, and 10 days from 1958 to 2010 at the Gangcha station on the Tibetan Plateau (Fig. 7a–c).

The SCDs (per year) in the Bayan Har Mountains, the Anemaqen Mountains, the Inner Mongolia Plateau, and the Northeast Plain, exhibit a significant upward trend (Fig. 6a). For example, at the Shiqu station on the eastern border of the Tibetan Plateau, the SCD (per year) increased 26 days from 1960 to 2010 (Fig. 7d). The coexistence of negative and positive trends in the SCD (per year) change was also reported by Bulygina et al. (2009) and Wang and Li (2012).

### 3.3 Spatiotemporal variations of SCOD

#### 3.3.1 SCOD variations

The SCOD is closely related to both latitude and elevation (Fig. 8a). For example, snowfall begins in September on the Tibetan Plateau, in early or middle October on the Daxingganling, and in middle or late October on the Altai Mountains in Xinjiang. The
SCOD also varies from one year to another (Table 2). Using the definition of a year with a positive (negative) SCD (per year) anomaly, as introduced before (i.e. 70% stations with positive (negative) SCOD anomaly and 30% stations with SCOD larger (smaller) than the mean +/- 1SD), we consider a given year as a late (early) SCOD year. Two years, 1996 and 2006, can be considered as late SCOD years on a large scale (Table 2), especially in 2006, in East China and the Tibetan Plateau (Fig.5d). Only one year, 1982, can be considered as an early SCOD year.

3.3.2 SCOD trends

There are 196 stations (66%) with a significant trend of late SCOD, and 8 stations (3%) with a significant trend of early SCOD (both at the 90% level), while 31% of the stations show no significant trends (Table 4). The SCOD in the major snow regions in China exhibits a significant trend towards late SCOD (Fig. 6b). These significantly late trends dominate the major snow regions in China. In particular, the late SCOD in Northeast China is consistent with a previous study (Li et al., 2009). Only the SCOD in the East Liaoning Bay region exhibits a significant trend towards early SCOD. For example, the SCOD at the Pingliang station in Gansu Province shows a late rate of 5.2 days per decade from 1952 to 2010, but the SCOD at the Weichang station in Hebei Province shows an early rate of 5.2 days per decade from 1952 to 2010 (Fig. 7e–f).

3.4 Spatiotemporal variations of SCED

3.4.1 SCED variations

The pattern of SCED is similar to that of SCOD (Fig. 8b), i.e. places with early snowfall normally show late snowmelt, while places with late snowfall normally show
early snowmelt. Like the SCOD, temporal variations of SCED are large (Table 2). Using the same standard for defining the SCOD anomaly, we judge a given year as a late (early) SCED year. Three years, 1957, 1976 and 1979, can be considered as late SCED years on a large scale (Table 2). It is evident that 1957 was a typical year whose SCED was late, which was also the reason for the great SCDs (Fig. 5a and e). The SCED in 1997 was early for almost all of China except for the Tibetan Plateau, western Tianshan Mountains, and western Liaoning (Fig. 5f).

3.4.2 SCED trends

For the SCED, there are 103 stations (35%) with a significantly early trend (at the 90% level), while 64% of stations show no significant trends (Table 4). The major snow regions in China all show early SCED, significant for Northeast China, North Xinjiang and the Tibetan Plateau (Fig. 6c). The tendency of late SCED is limited, with only 3 stations (1%) showing a significant trend. For example, the SCED at the Jixi station in Northeast China shows an early rate of 3.5 days per decade from 1952 to 2010, while the SCED at the Maerkang station in Sichuan Province shows a late rate of 4.2 days per decade from 1954 to 2010 (Fig. 7g–h).

4 Discussion

In the context of global warming, 196 stations (66%) show significantly late SCOD, and 103 stations (35%) show significantly early SCED, all at the 90% confidence level. It is not necessary for one station to show both significantly late SCOD and early SCED. This explains why only 12% of stations show a significantly negative SCD (per year) trend, while 75% of stations show no significant change in the
SCD (per year) trends. The latter is inconsistent with the overall shortening of the snow period in the Northern Hemisphere reported by Choi et al. (2010). One reason could be the different time periods used in the two studies, 1972–2007 in Choi et al. (2010) as compared with 1952–2010 in this study. Below, we discuss the possible connections between the spatiotemporal variations of snow cover and the warming climate and changing AO.

4.1 Relationship with TBZD

The number of days with temperature below 0°C (TBZD) plays an important role in the SCD (per year). There are 280 stations (95% of 296 stations) showing positive correlations between TBZD and SCD (per year), with 154 of them (52%) having significantly positive correlations (Table 4, Fig. 6d). For example, there is a significantly positive correlation between SCD (per year) and TBZD at the Chengshantou station (Fig. 9a). Therefore, generally speaking, the smaller the TBZD, the shorter the SCD (per year).

For the SCOD, there are 245 stations with negative correlations with TBZD, accounting for 83% of 296 stations, whereas only 51 stations (17%) show positive correlations (Table 4). This means that for smaller TBZD, the SCOD is later. For the SCED, there are 269 stations with positive correlations, accounting for 91% of 296 stations, whereas only 27 stations (9%) have negative correlations. This means that for smaller TBZD, the SCED is earlier.

Very similar results are found for the MAT (Table 4, Fig. 6e), and Fig. 9b shows an example (the Tieli station).
4.2 Relationship with AO

Although the AO index showed a strong positive trend in the past decades (Thompson et al., 2000), its impact on the SCD (per year) in China is spatially distinctive. Positive correlations (46% of 296 stations) are found in the eastern Tibetan Plateau and the Loess Plateau (Table 4, Fig. 6f), and Fig. 9c shows an example (the Huajialing station). Negative correlations (54% of 296 stations) exist in North Xinjiang, Northeast China and the Shandong Peninsula, and Fig. 9d shows an example (the Tonghua station).

5 Conclusion

This study examines the snow cover change based on 672 stations in 1952–2010 in China. Specifically, the 296 stations with more than ten annual mean SCDs are used to study the changing trends of SCD (per year), SCOD, and SCED, and SCD (per year) relationships with TBZD, MAT, and AO index during snow seasons. Some important results are summarized below.

Northeast China, North Xinjiang, and the Tibetan Plateau are the three major snow regions. The overall inter-annual variability of SCD (per year) is large in China. The years with a positive SCD (per year) anomaly in China include 1955, 1957, 1964, and 2010, while the years with a negative SCD (per year) anomaly are 1953, 1965, 1999, 2002, and 2009. Only 12% of stations show a significantly negative SCD (per year) trend, while 75% of stations show no significant SCD trends. Our analyses indicate that the SCD (per year) distribution pattern and trends in China are very complex and are not controlled by any single climate variable examined (i.e. TBZD, MAT, or AO), but a
combination of multiple variables.

It is found that significantly late SCOD occurs in nearly the entire China except for the east Liaoning Bay region; significantly early SCED occurs in nearly all major snow regions in China. Both the SCOD and SCED are closely related to the TBZD and MAT, and are mostly controlled by local latitude and elevation. Owing to global warming since 1950s, the reduced TBZD and increased MAT are the main reasons for overall late SCOD and early SCED, although it is not necessary for one station to experience both significantly late SCOD and early SCED. This explains why only 12% of stations show significantly negative SCD (per year) trends, while 75% of stations show no significant SCD (per year) trends.

Long-duration, consistent records of snow cover and depth are rare in China because of many challenges associated with taking accurate and representative measurements, especially in western China; the station density and metric choice also vary with time and locality. Therefore, more accurate and reliable observation data are needed to further analyse the spatiotemporal distribution and features of snow cover phenology. Atmospheric circulation causes variability in the snow cover phenology, and its effect requires deeper investigations.

Acknowledgments

This work is financially supported by the Program for National Nature Science Foundation of China (No. 41371391), and the Program for the Specialized Research Fund for the Doctoral Program of Higher Education of China (No. 20120091110017).
This work is also partially supported by Collaborative Innovation Center of Novel Software Technology and Industrialization. We would like to thank the National Climate Center of China (NCC) in Beijing for providing valuable climate datasets. We thank the three anonymous reviewers and the editor for valuable comments and suggestions that greatly improved the quality of this paper.

References


Robinson, D. A. and Dewey, K. F.: Recent secular variations in the extent of northern

Scherrer, S. C., Appenzeller, C. and Laternser, M.: Trends in Swiss Alpine snow days:
The role of local- and large-scale climate variability, Geophys. Res. Lett., 31, L13215,
2004.


Snow variability in the Swiss Alps 1864-2009, Int. J. Clim., 33(15), 3162 - 3173,

Serquet, G., Marty, C., Dulex, J-P. and Rebetez, M.: Seasonal trends and temperature
dependence of the snowfall/precipitation-day ratio in Switzerland, Geophys. Res. Lett.,
38, L07703, 2011.

century as simulated by a high resolution regional climate model, Environ. Res. Lett.,
6, 045401, 2011.

Tang, X., Yan, X., Ni, M. and Lu, Y.: Changes of the snow cover days on Tibet Plateau

Thompson, D. W. J. and Wallace, J. M.: The Arctic oscillation signature in the
wintertime geopotential height and temperature fields, Geophys. Res. Lett., 25,


Table Captions

Table 1. Prediction errors of cross-validation for the spatial interpolation with the ordinary kriging method.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item (Figures)</th>
<th>Mean error</th>
<th>Average standard error</th>
<th>Root mean squared error</th>
<th>Root mean squared standardized error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean SCD (Fig.3a)</td>
<td>-0.0230</td>
<td>11.0558</td>
<td>13.7311</td>
<td>1.1097</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV (Fig.3b)</td>
<td>0.0017</td>
<td>0.7364</td>
<td>0.5510</td>
<td>0.7579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCD in 1957 (Fig.5a)</td>
<td>-0.0015</td>
<td>11.1561</td>
<td>13.4662</td>
<td>1.1898</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCD in 2002 (Fig.5b)</td>
<td>0.0306</td>
<td>6.6185</td>
<td>8.5887</td>
<td>1.2522</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCD in 2008 (Fig.5c)</td>
<td>0.0477</td>
<td>7.3167</td>
<td>8.1968</td>
<td>1.0969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCED in 1957 (Fig.5d)</td>
<td>-0.0449</td>
<td>15.0528</td>
<td>18.9860</td>
<td>1.1921</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCED in 1997 (Fig.5e)</td>
<td>0.0696</td>
<td>15.5722</td>
<td>17.7793</td>
<td>1.1040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOD in 2006 (Fig.5f)</td>
<td>0.0482</td>
<td>15.4503</td>
<td>16.1757</td>
<td>1.0449</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCOD (Fig.8a)</td>
<td>0.0293</td>
<td>11.2458</td>
<td>13.9078</td>
<td>1.1712</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCED (Fig.8b)</td>
<td>-0.0222</td>
<td>15.2265</td>
<td>18.3095</td>
<td>1.1308</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Percentage (%) of stations with anomalies (P for positive and N for negative) of snow cover day (SCD (per year)), snow cover onset date (SCOD), and snow cover end date (SCED). Percentage (%) of stations with anomalies of SCD (per year), SCOD, and SCED larger (smaller) than the mean +/- one or two standard deviations (1SD or 2SD), with the bold number denoting years with a positive (negative) SCD (per year) anomaly, and late (early) years for SCOD or SCED in China. All the percentages are calculated based on 672 stations.

| Year | P  | 1SD | 2SD  | -2SD | -1SD | N  | P  | 1SD | 2SD  | -2SD | -1SD | N  | P  | 1SD | 2SD  | -2SD | -1SD |
|------|----|-----|------|------|------|----|----|-----|------|------|------|----|----|-----|------|------|------|------|
| 1952 | 31 | 2   | 0    | 13   | 33   | 69 | 69 | 40  | 21   | 2    | 9    | 31 | 55 | 17  | 6   | 12  | 17  | 45  |
| 1953 | 28 | 7   | 0    | 3    | 36   | 72 | 40 | 8   | 2    | 2    | 18   | 60 | 37 | 8   | 1   | 10  | 18  | 63  |
| 1954 | 57 | 1   | 3    | 12   | 0    | 8  | 43 | 35  | 8    | 4    | 1    | 18  | 65 | 56 | 11  | 0   | 0   | 10  | 44  |
| 1955 | 79 | 45  | 25   | 5    | 21   | 37 | 9  | 4   | 1    | 22   | 63  | 77 | 21 | 2   | 1   | 6   | 23  |
| 1956 | 46 | 10  | 0    | 0    | 4    | 54 | 69 | 20  | 2    | 0    | 9    | 31 | 61 | 24  | 1   | 2   | 12  | 39  |
| 1957 | 85 | 62  | 26   | 0    | 3    | 15 | 26 | 6   | 1    | 0    | 15   | 74 | 84 | 35  | 5   | 1   | 4   | 16  |
| 1958 | 48 | 15  | 4    | 0    | 14   | 52 | 46 | 17  | 0    | 0    | 18   | 54 | 52 | 17  | 3   | 4   | 18  | 48  |
| 1959 | 28 | 7   | 1    | 4    | 23   | 72 | 53 | 26  | 8    | 1    | 18   | 47 | 59 | 23  | 3   | 1   | 5   | 41  |
| 1960 | 37 | 13  | 3    | 0    | 16   | 63 | 49 | 11  | 2    | 0    | 10   | 51 | 59 | 24  | 6   | 4   | 18  | 41  |
| 1961 | 36 | 7   | 1    | 1    | 18   | 64 | 25 | 9   | 2    | 1    | 27   | 75 | 30 | 6   | 1   | 7   | 26  | 70  |
| 1962 | 41 | 11  | 3    | 0    | 10   | 59 | 44 | 13  | 4    | 2    | 10   | 56 | 58 | 18  | 3   | 0   | 11  | 42  |
| 1963 | 25 | 5   | 2    | 2    | 27   | 75 | 34 | 14  | 5    | 1    | 23   | 66 | 51 | 14  | 0   | 8   | 17  | 49  |
| 1964 | 76 | 36  | 11   | 0    | 1    | 24 | 31 | 3   | 1    | 4    | 24   | 69 | 64 | 18  | 1   | 0   | 5   | 36  |
| 1965 | 26 | 8   | 0    | 1    | 32   | 74 | 59 | 18  | 5    | 1    | 8    | 41 | 55 | 14  | 2   | 3   | 17  | 45  |
| 1966 | 28 | 6   | 1    | 0    | 13   | 72 | 46 | 21  | 6    | 0    | 13   | 54 | 67 | 12  | 1   | 2   | 5   | 33  |
| 1967 | 31 | 5   | 0    | 3    | 23   | 69 | 40 | 11  | 3    | 2    | 15   | 60 | 43 | 5   | 0   | 3   | 12  | 57  |
| 1968 | 61 | 29  | 12   | 3    | 8    | 39 | 35 | 8   | 1    | 0    | 13   | 65 | 34 | 13  | 0   | 4   | 26  | 66  |
| 1969 | 42 | 18  | 5    | 4    | 21   | 58 | 45 | 13  | 1    | 3    | 20   | 55 | 67 | 20  | 1   | 1   | 7   | 33  |
| 1970 | 46 | 15  | 1    | 2    | 11   | 54 | 38 | 10  | 3    | 2    | 24   | 62 | 62 | 19  | 3   | 0   | 7   | 38  |
| 1971 | 53 | 12  | 1    | 1    | 9    | 47 | 38 | 15  | 4    | 1    | 17   | 62 | 53 | 9   | 1   | 1   | 8   | 47  |
| 1972 | 55 | 23  | 11   | 0    | 8    | 45 | 37 | 9   | 2    | 1    | 21   | 63 | 46 | 16  | 4   | 1   | 9   | 54  |
| 1973 | 50 | 19  | 2    | 1    | 7    | 50 | 35 | 10  | 1    | 2    | 23   | 65 | 43 | 9   | 1   | 1   | 8   | 57  |
| 1974 | 33 | 8   | 0    | 3    | 23   | 67 | 53 | 29  | 6    | 1    | 11   | 47 | 52 | 12  | 1   | 1   | 10  | 48  |
| 1975 | 41 | 10  | 4    | 1    | 15   | 59 | 26 | 7   | 2    | 1    | 21   | 74 | 43 | 15  | 3   | 2   | 16  | 57  |
| 1976 | 35 | 11  | 3    | 1    | 23   | 65 | 60 | 25  | 12   | 0    | 5    | 40 | 77 | 31  | 5   | 1   | 3   | 23  |
| 1977 | 45 | 20  | 3    | 0    | 9    | 55 | 28 | 5   | 1    | 0    | 25   | 72 | 57 | 14  | 3   | 2   | 12  | 43  |
| 1978 | 60 | 22  | 8    | 0    | 2    | 40 | 43 | 13  | 2    | 2    | 13   | 57 | 55 | 10  | 1   | 0   | 8   | 45  |
|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
| 2010 | 75   | 42   | 11   | 0    | 10   | 25   | 42   | 11   | 2    | 1    | 18   | 58   | 72   | 20   | 1    | 1    | 7    | 28   | 678  | 679  | 680  | 681  | 682  | 683  | 684  | 685  | 686  | 687  | 688  | 689  |
Table 3. The same as Table 2, but only for the years with a positive (negative) SCD (per year) anomaly and only for the three major stable snow regions: Northeast China (78 stations), North Xinjiang (21 stations) and the Tibetan Plateau (63 stations).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Northeast China</th>
<th>North Xinjiang</th>
<th>Tibetan Plateau</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1SD</td>
<td>2SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1957</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1959</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1973</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4. Significance of trends according to Mann-Kendall test of SCD (per year), SCOD, and SCED, significance of relationships among SCD (per year), SCOD, SCED, respectively, with TBZD, significance of relationship between SCD (per year) and MAT, and significance of relationship between SCD (per year) and AO (296 stations in total). All of them have two significance levels, the 90% and 95%.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>SCD (per year)</th>
<th>SCOD</th>
<th>SCED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>I*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trend Positive</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TBZD Positive</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAT Positive</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AO Positive</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negative</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Note: I* for insignificant trends or relations)
Figure Captions

Figure 1. Locations of weather stations and major basins, mountains and plains mentioned in the paper, overlying the digital elevation model for China.

Figure 2. Percentage of weather stations with different measurement lengths.

Figure 3. Annual mean snow cover days (SCDs) from 1980/81 to 2009/10 (a), and their coefficients of variation (CV) (b).

Figure 4. Seasonal variation of SCDs; the number in the centre denotes annual mean SCDs, the blue colour in the circle the SCDs for winter season, the green colour for spring, and the red colour for autumn.

Figure 5. SCD (per year) anomalies in 1957 (a), 2002 (b) and 2008 (c), anomaly of snow cover onset date (SCOD) in 2006 (d), and anomalies of snow cover end date (SCED) in 1957 (e) and 1997 (f).

Figure 6. Significance of trends according to Mann-Kendall test of SCDs (per year) (a), SCOD (b), and SCED (c) from the 296 stations with more than ten annual mean SCDs, significance of relationship between the SCD (per year) and day with temperature below 0°C (TBZD) (d), significance of relationship between the SCD (per year) and mean air temperature (MAT) (e), and significance of relationship between the SCD (per year) and Arctic Oscillation (AO) index (f).

Figure 7. SCD (per year) variations at Kuandian (40°43’ N, 124°47’E, 260.1 m) (a), Hongliuhe (41°32’ N, 94°40’E, 1573.8 m) (b), Gangcha (37°20’ N, 100°08’E, 3301.5 m) (c) and Shiqu (32°59’ N, 98°06’E, 4533.0 m) (d), SCOD at Pingliang (35°33’ N,
106°40'E, 1412.0 m) (e) and Weichang (41°56' N, 117°45'E, 842.8 m) (f), and SCED at Jixi (45°18' N, 130°56'E, 280.8 m) (g) and Maerkang (31°54' N, 102°54'E, 2664.4 m) (h). (The unit on the Y-axis in the figures e, f, g, h denotes the Julian day using 1st September as reference).

Figure 8. Spatial distribution of SCOD (a) and SCED (b) based on the stations with an average of more than ten SCDs (per year).

Figure 9. SCD (per year) relationships with TBZD at Chengshantou (37°24' N, 122°41'E, 47.7 m) (a), MAT at Tieli (46°59' N, 128°01'E, 210.5 m) (b), and AO index at Huajialing (35°23' N, 105°00'E, 2450.6 m) (c) and Tonghua (41°41' N, 125°54'E, 402.9 m) (d).
Figure 1

Figure 2
Figure 3

Figure 4
Figure 5
Figure 6
Figure 7
Figure 8

Figure 9