Interactive comment on “Hierarchy theory in hydropedology” by T. F. H. Allen et al.

M. Sivapalan
sivapala@uiuc.edu

Received and published: 5 April 2009

I read this paper with a lot of interest, thinking that it would assist me to deal with the complex issues that I face in dealing with hydropedological research. However, I am very much disappointed.

The paper reads as a rather unstructured tutorial on the merits of hierarchy theory. Even on that narrow score of presenting what is hierarchy theory (as opposed to its merits) it fails to impress me, and I would not recommend publication in HESS.

Secondly, this is a paper that is supposed to discuss the potential application of hierarchy theory to hydropedology. I am not sure if the authors even recognize what hydropedology is and how hierarchy theory can assist its practice. The biggest problem with the paper is the lack of a concrete example, specifically from hydropedology, to illustrate such an application. In the absence of this, I do not know how this paper
can contribute to this special issue.

I am prepared to believe that the authors are experts on hierarchy theory, but experts of hydropedology they appear not. This kind of philosophical and non-technical presentation, without concrete examples, is not suitable for such a special issue. Therefore I am not able to support its publication in its present form in HESS.

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 6, 2931, 2009.