Interactive comment on “Combining flow routing modelling and direct velocity measurement for optimal discharge estimation” by G. Corato et al.

Anonymous Referee #1

Received and published: 4 May 2011

Corato et al. explore the use of flood routing modelling to support discharge estimations. The topic of the paper is definitely germane. Nevertheless, I found reviewing it extremely tricky. Possibly due to the fact that the overall presentation of the study is unclear, I could not notice innovative ideas, concepts, or tools. Nor could I appreciate clear progresses from what has been published by Perumal, Moramarco, Barbetta, Arico, Dottori, etc... Lastly, I felt the conclusions are not supported by the results, but this might have been caused (again) by the imprecise language of the paper. Anyhow, given the potential of this study and the significance of the topic, I feel the authors should make a serious effort to improve the description of their work, and re-structure the entire paper (and perhaps ask a native speaker to review their English, which is unacceptable in the current version) to "bring to light" their own original contribution.

C1314

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., 8, 2699, 2011.