Interactive comment on “Demonstrating the “Unit Hydrograph” and flow routing processes involving active student participation – A university lecture experiment” by Karsten Schulz et al.

Anonymous Referee #2

Received and published: 2 January 2018

1. This paper presents a creative method of teaching the Unit Hydrograph, a fundamental concept in hydrology, in an interactive and non-lecture format. This would be a good addition to HESS as more and more instructors hope to incorporate non-traditional and active methods of teaching STEM concepts to suit different types of learning styles. While the demonstration may not be feasible in some cases, this paper presents one option of teaching the UH concept and could be the basis of different modifications to suit individual classroom needs.

2. One general concern I had was that the authors cited “strong difficulties in students’ perceptions of the UH’ as the motivation for using the active demonstration. However,
I could not find what specifically the previous concerns were and if they were actually addressed/reflected in the final evaluations after the demonstration. I believe summarizing some of these learning difficulties and how the demonstration overcomes them would help convince other readers to try this method, especially if they are encountering the same issues with their students.

3. The organization of the paper as well as the figures are of good quality; the only concern regarding the writing pertains to some awkward phrasing and some typographic errors (see technical corrections in supplement).

Please also note the supplement to this comment: