Interactive comment on “Small scale characterization of vine plant root water uptake via 3D electrical resistivity tomography and Mise-à-la-Masse method” by Benjamin Mary et al.

M Vancllooster (Editor)
marnik.vancllooster@uclouvain.be

Received and published: 21 August 2018

Dear Authors,

Your manuscript HESS-2018-238 received 2 detailed referee reports. Both referees appreciated the novelty of the research but regretted that some methodological details are lacking.

The second referee identified also a set of concerns related to the plant physiological and biological aspects of the experiment. He/she also strongly suggested having an independent observation of root mass distribution to validate the indirect assessment as made with the MALM. I’m afraid that this last concern cannot be considered since this would mean a completely new experimental set-up.

Given the novelty of the research, I suggest incorporating the many detailed remarks in a major revision of the paper. I also suggest introducing a more detailed description of the methodological aspects and a discussion on how the validation can be strengthened in the future by independent root mass distribution observations.

I look forward to receiving a major revised version of this interesting manuscript.

Sincerely yours,